

Forced Religious Conversions in Pakistan

Haji Sanwan Alias Fayaz Hyder

Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan,

Email: sanwanphullmahe@gmail.com

Dr. Tansif Ur Rehman

Department of Law, Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan,

Email: tansif@live.com

Atta Muhammad

Department of Law of Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan,

Email: attaphull2001@gmail.com

Prof. Dr. Sobia Anees Shahzad

Department of Sociology, University of Karachi,

Email: sobia.soc@live.com

Adnan Zawar

M. Phill, Research Scholar, Institute of Social & Cultural Studies, University of the Punjab,

Email: adnan.zawar@gmail.com

Mehmood Ahmed Usmani

Research Scholar, Department of Sociology, University of Karachi,

Email: mehmoodausmani@gmail.com

Syed Adeel Ali Bukhari

Ph.D. Research Scholar, Department of Public Administration, University of Karachi,

Email: adeelali84@hotmail.com

The manuscript has not been previously published elsewhere and is not being considered by any other journal. The authors read and approved the final version of the respective manuscript.

Note: The authors have no conflict of interest to declare

Abstract

This research critically examines the alarming phenomenon of forced conversions among religious minorities in Pakistan, with a particular focus on the Sindhi Hindu community. It investigates the intricate sociocultural, economic, and gender-based vulnerabilities that facilitate these coercive practices, shedding light on the influential role of religious leaders and societal pressures. The study analyzes the existing legal framework in Pakistan, identifying significant gaps that enable forced conversions to persist despite constitutional guarantees of religious freedom. Additionally, it evaluates the formidable challenges law enforcement and the judiciary face in delivering justice to victims. The research further explores the profound psychological and social effects of forced conversions on victims and their families, highlighting the disproportionate targeting of women and girls. By proposing comprehensive legal and policy reforms, this study aims to fortify protections for religious minorities and enhance Pakistan's commitment to human rights, contributing to a deeper understanding of forced conversions and advocating for accountability and reform within the legal system.

Keywords: *forced conversion, influential role, legal framework, religious minorities, Pakistan.*

Introduction

Forced conversions of religious minorities in Pakistan have emerged as a profound human rights issue, particularly affecting Hindus, Christians, and Sikhs. These communities face widespread sociocultural, economic, and gender-based vulnerabilities, especially in Sindh, where the majority of Pakistan's Hindu population resides. Cases involving young Hindu girls being abducted, forcibly converted to Islam, and married to Muslim men are alarmingly frequent, highlighting entrenched religious intolerance and patriarchal practices (Batool et al., 2022). Religious leaders often play a direct role in these conversions, framing them as

religious obligations. This troubling dynamic underscores how religion and socioeconomic dependence intertwine to perpetuate inequality and injustice in the country (Hussain, 2021).

The Hindus are vulnerable due to their economic marginalization. Many Hindu families live in poverty and rely on wealthier Muslim landlords, creating a power imbalance that is easily exploited. This dependence exacerbates their risk of coercion, especially when it comes to the forced conversion of young girls. These cases are often facilitated or endorsed by religious leaders, making it extremely difficult for Hindu families to resist or seek justice (Afzal et al., 2022). Law enforcement agencies are frequently complicit or inactive, and socio-political pressures prevent victims from receiving justice. The intersection of economic vulnerability, religious coercion, and weak legal protections leaves minority communities, especially in rural Sindh, in a precarious position (Caron & Khan, 2022).

Despite constitutional guarantees of religious freedom, including Article 20 (Freedom to profess religion and to manage religious institutions) of the Constitution of Pakistan - 1973, forced conversions continue unabated, reflecting a gap between legal provisions and their enforcement. In 2016, the Sindh Criminal Law (Protection of Minorities) Bill was introduced to address the issue of forced conversions.

However, it faced strong opposition from religious groups and has yet to be implemented. The political influence of these groups often prevents meaningful legal reforms, while law enforcement officials, swayed by societal biases, fail to protect minority communities effectively. Victims of forced conversions are frequently denied justice as the legal system remains largely ineffective in dealing with the perpetrators, further highlighting the weakness of Pakistan's judicial and law enforcement institutions (Khalid, 2022).

The gendered nature of forced conversions is a critical dimension that requires closer examination. Women and girls from minority communities are disproportionately targeted due to their vulnerability to gender-based violence and lower social status. Many cases involve abductions where girls are coerced into converting to Islam and marrying Muslim men, often leaving them with no legal or social recourse. The

trauma of forced conversion affects not only the individual victims but also their families, who are stigmatized and ostracized within their communities. The psychological impact of such incidents is profound, with victims often enduring long-lasting emotional distress while their families face social isolation and economic hardship. The lack of robust institutional support further compounds these issues, leaving minority women particularly vulnerable to exploitation and abuse (Waheed, 2022).

The issue of forced conversions in Pakistan has drawn significant international attention, with numerous human rights organizations condemning the Pakistani government's failure to protect its religious minorities. Reports such as the UN Human Rights Council and Amnesty International have urged Pakistan to uphold international human rights standards and ensure religious freedom for all citizens. Despite these international pressures, the Pakistani government has struggled to implement effective legal and policy reforms to curb forced conversions, thereby damaging its global human rights reputation (Patimah et al., 2021).

Research Justification

Forced conversions of religious minorities in Pakistan, particularly Hindus, Christians, and Sikhs, remain a critical human rights issue, drawing both national and international concern. These minorities frequently face the threat of forced conversions due to their sociocultural, economic, and gender-based vulnerabilities. In Pakistan, where religious intolerance and discriminatory practices against minorities persist, it is essential to investigate the root causes of forced conversions, particularly in areas like Sindh, where minorities are most vulnerable (Walter, 2021). Despite constitutional provisions and legal protections meant to safeguard religious freedom, enforcing these laws is weak. Loopholes within the legal system and inadequate implementation have allowed forced conversions to continue unchecked (Shah & Lashari, 2023).

Law enforcement and the judiciary often face significant challenges, including socio-political pressure, religious biases, and the influence of religious leaders, resulting in delayed or denied justice for victims (Latif, 2023).

Women and girls from minority communities are disproportionately targeted for forced conversions and forced marriages, making it a severe violation of both religious and gender rights (Kavesh, 2023).

Research Objectives

1. To examine the sociocultural and economic factors contributing to forced conversions of religious minorities in Pakistan.
2. To analyze the effectiveness of Pakistan's legal framework in preventing forced conversions and protecting religious freedom.
3. To investigate the gender-specific dynamics of forced conversions, focusing on the vulnerability of women and girls from minority communities.
4. To assess the psychological and social effects of forced conversions on victims and their families, exploring long-term consequences on community cohesion and mental health.
5. To propose actionable legal and policy reforms to strengthen protections for religious minorities and prevent forced conversions in Pakistan.

Research Methodology

This study employed a systematic review methodology, with research objectives established accordingly. A comprehensive literature review was conducted (Komba & Lwoga, 2020). Research findings were categorized based on their content (Hiver et al., 2021; Petticrew & Roberts, 2006), and classified information was incorporated into the study by organizing it into headings (Gan et al., 2021; Pawson et al., 2005). The evaluation of classified information and titles formed the basis of the study (Page, 2021; Rahi, 2017), ensuring the integrity of the research subject and its contents (Egger et al., 2022; Victor, 2008).

Literature Review

1. Sociocultural and economic factors regarding forced conversions in Pakistan

The historical context of forced conversions in Pakistan is intricately linked to the sociocultural and economic vulnerabilities of religious minorities, particularly the Sindhi Hindu community. Following the

partition of British India in 1947, Pakistan was established as an Islamic state, resulting in significant shifts in the religious demographics of the region (Firdaus et al., 2023). This transition has been marked by increasing discrimination and violence against some non-Muslim communities, creating an environment conducive to forced conversions (Ramzan, 2023).

Sociocultural factors, including traditional gender roles and community pressures, significantly contribute to the vulnerability of minority groups. Religious intolerance, fueled by extremist ideologies and societal norms, leads to coercive tactics employed by religious leaders to convert individuals from minority faiths (Afzal et al., 2022).

Economically, the marginalization of these communities exacerbates their vulnerability; many religious minorities face poverty and limited access to education and resources, making them susceptible to coercive tactics that promise financial security in exchange for conversion (Fareed et al., 2021). Overall, the interplay of historical, sociocultural, and economic factors has created a precarious situation for religious minorities in Pakistan, fostering an environment where forced conversions can thrive unchecked.

2. Leading minority protection laws in Pakistan

Pakistan's legal framework for protecting minority rights has evolved over the years, yet it remains fraught with challenges (Jehangir, 2021). The Constitution of Pakistan provides certain protections for religious minorities under Article 20, which guarantees the right to profess and practice one's religion (Jangbar, 2022). However, these protections often fail to translate into practical safeguards against forced conversions, primarily due to weak enforcement and societal pressures (Khan et al., 2022).

In 2016, the Sindh Assembly passed the Sindh Criminal Law (Protection of Minorities) Bill, which aimed to criminalize forced conversions and establish a legal framework for protecting religious minorities (Ali, 2021). This law mandates that any individual converting to another religion must do so voluntarily and without coercion, requiring a declaration to this effect (Afzal et al., 2022). Despite its progressive intent, the bill has faced opposition from conservative religious factions, resulting in limited implementation (Amin et al., 2022).

Moreover, various international human rights conventions, such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, obligate Pakistan to uphold the rights of religious minorities. However, the gap between international commitments and domestic realities continues to widen, as many minority communities remain vulnerable to coercion and violence (Yang et al., 2022). The ineffective enforcement of existing laws, coupled with societal intolerance, undermines the legal protections intended to safeguard religious minorities in Pakistan (Salam-Salmaoui & Ali, 2024).

3. Gender-specific dynamics regarding forced conversions in Pakistan

The gender-specific dynamics of forced conversions in Pakistan reveal a troubling pattern, particularly in how women and girls from religious minorities are disproportionately targeted (Vandamme, 2022). Social norms and gender roles contribute significantly to the vulnerability of these individuals, often rendering them more susceptible to coercive tactics employed by perpetrators of forced conversions (Zhang, 2021). In many cases, women and girls face unique pressures that stem from patriarchal societal structures (Zaidi, 2022). Religious leaders may exploit these vulnerabilities, using tactics that specifically target women, such as abduction, emotional manipulation, or threats of violence (Manan et al., 2022).

The intersection of gender and religion complicates the situation further; women may be pressured to convert not only for personal safety but also due to familial expectations or societal norms that prioritize their roles as caretakers and supporters of the family (Zia et al., 2024). Furthermore, the psychological impact of forced conversions on women can be profound, affecting their sense of identity and belonging (Rahman & Ahmed, 2022). Women who are forcibly converted often face stigma and isolation from their communities, leading to long-term emotional distress (Niyozov & Khan, 2024). The gendered aspects of forced conversions necessitate a targeted approach to understanding and addressing these issues within the broader context of minority rights in Pakistan, emphasizing the need for protective measures that consider the unique challenges faced by women (Baqai, 2022).

4. **Psychological and social effects of forced conversions on victims and their families in Pakistan**

The psychological and social effects of forced conversions on victims and their families in Pakistan is profound and multifaceted (Aksakalova & Chatterji, 2023). Victims of forced conversions often experience significant emotional distress, including anxiety, depression, and trauma (Shah et al., 2024). The coercive nature of these conversions can lead to a profound loss of identity and belonging, as individuals are often torn away from their cultural and religious roots (Akram, 2024). Families of victims also face severe repercussions, including social stigma, ostracization, and economic hardship (Batool et al., 2022). When a family member is forcibly converted, the entire family may be marginalized within their community, leading to a loss of social standing and support (Hussain, 2021).

The trauma of forced conversions can disrupt familial bonds, creating rifts that affect the family's overall cohesion and functioning (Caron & Khan, 2022). In many cases, families may feel helpless in protecting their loved ones, further exacerbating their psychological distress (Khalid, 2022). Moreover, the societal implications of forced conversions extend beyond individual families, contributing to a culture of fear and mistrust among religious minorities (Waheed, 2022). The persistent threat of coercion undermines social cohesion as minority communities become increasingly isolated and marginalized (Patimah et al., 2021).

Addressing the psychological and social impact of forced conversions requires a comprehensive approach that includes mental health support for victims, community education on religious tolerance, and legal reforms to protect minority rights (Walter, 2021). By fostering an environment of understanding and support, Pakistan can begin to heal the wounds inflicted by forced conversions and promote a more inclusive society.

Discussion

The phenomenon of forced conversions in Pakistan, especially concerning the Sindhi Hindu minority, underscores the interplay of legal inadequacies, societal norms, and economic pressures. Although laws exist to protect minority rights, such as the Sindh Criminal Law (Protection of Minorities) Bill, these measures often fall short due to societal resistance and lack of enforcement.

Moreover, the targeted nature of these conversions raises critical concerns regarding the systematic marginalization of women and girls. The coercive tactics employed by religious extremists often exploit gender vulnerabilities, leading to psychological trauma and a sense of disempowerment among victims. It is compounded by the societal stigma faced by families of victims, further isolating them within their communities.

Addressing forced conversions necessitates a comprehensive strategy involving legal reforms, community engagement, and educational programs to foster religious tolerance and understanding. By prioritizing these areas, Pakistan can create an environment where all citizens, regardless of their faith, are protected and empowered to live freely, thus promoting social harmony and inclusivity.

Conclusion

The issue of forced conversions in Pakistan, particularly affecting the Sindhi Hindu minority, underscores significant challenges rooted in the interplay of sociocultural, economic, and gender dynamics. Despite constitutional guarantees and specific laws aimed at protecting religious minorities, such as the Sindh Criminal Law (Protection of Minorities) Bill, the implementation of these protections remains inconsistent and often ineffective. This legal gap, coupled with deep-seated societal biases, creates an environment where forced conversions can occur with relative impunity. The targeted nature of these conversions disproportionately affects women and girls, who face unique vulnerabilities due to entrenched patriarchal norms and societal expectations.

The emotional and psychological trauma experienced by victims is profound, resulting in long-term effects not only on the individuals directly involved but also on their families and communities. The stigma attached to forced conversions often leads to further isolation and marginalization of victims, exacerbating their suffering and diminishing their social support systems. Pakistan must adopt a comprehensive approach, strengthening legal frameworks and enhancing enforcement mechanisms. Additionally, community education initiatives aimed at

promoting religious tolerance and gender equality are essential to dismantling the societal norms that facilitate forced conversions.

Mental health support for victims and their families is vital for recovery and reintegration into society. Ultimately, addressing the issue of forced conversions is not merely a matter of legal compliance but a moral imperative reflecting justice and equality. By fostering inclusivity and respect for all religious beliefs, Pakistan can significantly enhance its human rights standing and pave the way for a more harmonious society where everyone can practice their faith freely and without fear.

Recommendations

- 1. Strengthen legal protections:** Review and amend existing laws to close loopholes and enhance penalties for those involved in forced conversions. It includes ensuring that laws like the Sindh Criminal Law (Protection of Minorities) Bill are effectively enforced.
- 2. Improve law enforcement training:** Provide specialized training for law enforcement agencies on handling forced conversions and religious discrimination cases. This training should focus on sensitivity to minority issues and upholding human rights.
- 3. Establish reporting mechanisms:** Create accessible and confidential reporting systems for victims of forced conversions to report incidents without fear of retaliation or discrimination. It could include hotline or community-based support centers.
- 4. Promote awareness campaigns:** Implement public awareness campaigns to educate communities about the rights of religious minorities and the negative impacts of forced conversions. These campaigns should target schools, local governments, and religious institutions.
- 5. Enhance support services:** Develop comprehensive support services for victims of forced conversions, including legal aid, psychological counseling, and rehabilitation programs to facilitate their reintegration into society.
- 6. Engage community leaders:** Involve local religious and community leaders in dialogues to promote interfaith harmony and understanding and address misconceptions and biases against religious minorities.

- 7. Conduct research and monitoring:** Support research initiatives to monitor trends and patterns of forced conversions, providing data that can inform policy-making and advocacy efforts to protect minority rights.
- 8. International collaboration:** Collaborate with international human rights organizations to share best practices and receive support in implementing strategies that protect minority rights and combat forced conversions.
- 9. Incorporate gender perspectives:** Ensure that policies and programs addressing forced conversions include a gendered approach, recognizing the unique vulnerabilities faced by women and girls in these situations.
- 10. Advocate for policy reforms:** Work with lawmakers and civil society organizations to advocate for broader policy reforms that promote religious tolerance, social justice, and human rights in Pakistan.

Research Limitations

This study on forced conversions among the Sindhi Hindu minority in Pakistan faces several limitations. First, the lack of reliable and comprehensive data on forced conversions poses a significant challenge, as many incidents remain unreported due to fear of retaliation or societal stigma. Second, the focus on a specific minority group may overlook the broader context of forced conversions affecting other religious communities in Pakistan. The complex legal environment may also complicate the analysis, as understanding the interplay between various laws requires detailed examination. Furthermore, time constraints limit the depth of engagement with affected communities and the thoroughness of data analysis. These limitations highlight the need for further research to capture the full scope of forced conversions and their impact on religious minorities in Pakistan.

Research Implications

The findings of this study on forced conversions among the Hindu minority in Pakistan have significant implications for policy, advocacy, and future research. First, the identified gaps in legal protections

highlight the urgent need for comprehensive reforms to strengthen the enforcement of existing laws safeguarding minority rights. Policymakers must prioritize these reforms to combat forced conversions effectively.

Second, the study underscores the importance of awareness campaigns aimed at educating both the public and law enforcement about the rights of religious minorities and the psychological impacts of forced conversions. Third, the focus on gender-specific dynamics calls for targeted interventions that address the unique vulnerabilities faced by women and girls in these situations. Finally, the research paves the way for further studies exploring the long-term social and psychological effects of forced conversions on victims and their families, contributing to a more nuanced understanding of this pressing human rights issue in Pakistan.

Future Research Directions

Future research on forced conversions among the Hindu minority in Pakistan should prioritize a multi-dimensional approach to understand the complexities of this issue better. Firstly, longitudinal studies are essential to assess the long-term psychological and social impacts of forced conversions on victims and their families. By tracking changes over time, researchers can provide insights into recovery processes and the effectiveness of support systems. Moreover, comparative studies involving different religious minorities in Pakistan could illuminate varying experiences and coping mechanisms, highlighting unique challenges faced by each group. This comparative analysis would enhance understanding of the broader sociocultural context that enables forced conversions. In addition, qualitative research methods, such as in-depth interviews and focus groups, should be employed to capture the personal narratives of victims. These narratives can provide valuable insights into the lived experiences of those affected, which quantitative data may overlook. Lastly, exploring the role of grassroots organizations and community leaders in combating forced conversions is vital. Investigating successful intervention strategies employed by these entities can inform policy recommendations and community-based solutions, ultimately contributing to the protection and empowerment of religious minorities in Pakistan.

References

- Afzal, N., Hameed, A., & Jabeen, I. (2022). The use of macro and micro structures in Pakistani prime minister's speech at UNGA: A critical discourse analysis approach. *Croatian International Relations Review*, 28(89), 39-61. <https://cirrj.org/menuascript/index.php/cirrj/article/view/484>
- Akram, U. (2024). *Exploring market entry strategies for Pakistani exports in Germany* (Doctoral dissertation). Technical University Ingolstadt of Applied Sciences. <https://opus4.kobv.de/opus4-haw/frontdoor/index/index/docId/5144>
- Aksakalova, O., & Chatterji, T. (2023). Combating isolationism through coil virtual exchange. In *Writing on the wall: Writing Education and Resistance to Isolationism*, 151. University Press of Colorado. 9781646423248
- Ali, M. I. (2021). United Nations convention on the rights of child: Forced conversion of Hindu minor girls in Pakistan. *Journal of Legal Studies*, 28(42), 186-201. <https://www.ceeol.com/search/article-detail?id=995576>
- Amin, M., Gul, A., Akhtar, S., & Naz, A. (2022). Financial action task force (FATF) and the Pakistan stance: An overview of the mandate, charter, effectiveness in the political scenario of Pakistan. *Journal of Policy Research*, 8(3), 473-480. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7624852>
- Baqai, H. N. S. (2022). A rearticulation of Pakistan's foreign policy in the wake of the twenty-first century challenges. *Global Pakistan: Pakistan's Role in the International System*, 171-194. <https://library.fes.de/pdf-files/bueros/pakistan/19335.pdf#page=183>
- Batool, M., Tehseem, T., & Shah, A. A. (2022). Exploring identity crises in Nadeem Aslam's maps for lost lovers: A conversation analysis. *Competitive Social Science Research Journal*, 3(1), 276-292. <https://cssrjournal.com/index.php/cssrjournal/article/view/146>
- Caron, J., & Khan, S. (2022). Writing war, and the politics of poetic conversation. *Critical Asian Studies*, 54(2), 149-170. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/14672715.2022.2030776>
- Egger, M., Higgins, J. P., & Smith, G. D. (Eds.). (2022). *Systematic reviews in health research: Meta-analysis in context*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Fareed, M., Sultan, S. R., & Shireen, K. (2021). Pakistani English stories for children: Linguistic and technical analysis. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 8(1), 95-108. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1308494>
- Firdaus, R., Datau, R. O., Bramantio, B., Afdholy, N., & Santoso, L. (2023). The politicization of Islam: Criticism of patrimony and the tradition of forced marriage in the novels - Woman with a Turban and the Holy Woman. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 10(8), 314-324. <https://ijmmu.com/index.php/ijmmu/article/view/4902>

- Gan, J., Xie, L., Peng, G., Xie, J., Chen, Y., & Yu, Q. (2021). Systematic review on modification methods of dietary fiber. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 119, 106872.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2021.106872>
- Hiver, P., Al-Hoorie, A. H., Vitta, J. P., & Wu, J. (2021). Engagement in language learning: A systematic review of 20 years of research methods and definitions. *Language Teaching Research*, 13621688211001289.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/13621688211001289>
- Hussain, G. (2021). Religious conversions in Pakistan: Empirical evidence from Sindh. *Policy Perspectives*, 18(1), 5-24.
<https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.13169/polipers.18.1.0005>
- Jangbar, S. (2022). Silence of a Pakistani Muslim woman: The influence of culture on the meaning of silence. *Journal of International and Intercultural Communication*, 15(2), 132-147.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/17513057.2021.1897153>
- Jehangir, A. (2021). Finding peace journalism: An analysis of media discourse on Afghan refugees and their forced repatriation from Pakistan.
<https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses1/1165/>
- Kavesh, M. A. (2023). Face-to-face with the (animal) other: An invitation to decolonize the anthropology of Pakistan. *American Ethnologist*, 50(3), 409-418.
<https://anthrosource.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/amet.13188>
- Khalid, A. (2022). The negotiations of Pakistani mothers' agency with structure: Towards a research practice of hearing 'silences' as a strategy. *Gender and Education*, 34(6), 659-673.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09540253.2022.2027888>
- Khan, M. A., Zaki, S., & Memon, N. (2022). Chinese as a mandatory foreign language at a higher education institution in Pakistan. *South Asia Research*, 43(1), 49-67.
<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/02627280221120328>
- Komba, M. M., & Lwoga, E. T. (2020). *Systematic review as a research method in library and information science*.
<https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-7998-1471-9.ch005>
- Latif, M. (2023). Performances and politics in Pakistan: A case study of a micro public sphere. *International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society*, 36(1), 99-117. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10767-022-09418-x>
- Manan, S. A., Channa, L. A., & Haidar, S. (2022). Celebratory or guilty multilingualism? English medium instruction challenges, pedagogical choices, and teacher agency in Pakistan. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 27(4), 530-545.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13562517.2022.2045932>

- Niyozov, S., & Khan, A. W. (2024). Education faculty perspectives on a borrowed teacher education initiative in Northern Pakistan: A call for engaging the discourses of policy borrowing and decolonization. *Journal of Education in Muslim Societies*, 5(2), 100-127.
<https://muse.jhu.edu/pub/3/article/928740/summary>
- Page, M. J., McKenzie, J. E., Bossuyt, P. M., Boutron, I., Hoffmann, T. C., Mulrow, C. D., Shamseer, L., Tetzlaff, J. M., & Moher, D. (2021). Updating guidance for reporting systematic reviews: Development of the PRISMA 2020 statement. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, 134, 103-112.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclinepi.2021.02.003>
- Patimah, E., Nurhantoro, T. S., & Susanti, D. L. (2021). Rethinking gender discrimination: The restriction of Pakistan women's rights through cultural and political interests as portrayed in Aisha Saeed's Amal unbound. *Journal of English Language and Language Teaching*, 5(1), 63-74.
<https://jurnal.ustjogja.ac.id/index.php/JELLT/article/view/10027>
- Pawson, R., Greenhalgh, T., Harvey, G., & Walshe, K. (2005). Realist review - A new method of systematic review designed for complex policy interventions. *Journal of Health Services Research & Policy*, 10(1),
<https://doi.org/10.1258/1355819054308530>
- Petticrew, M., & Roberts, H. (2006). *Systematic reviews in the social sciences: A practical guide*. Blackwell Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470754887>
- Rahi, S. (2017). Research design and methods: A systematic review of research paradigms, sampling issues, and instruments development. *International Journal of Economics & Management Sciences*, 6(2).
<https://doi.org/10.4172/2162-6359.1000403>
- Rahman, A., & Ahmed, M. E. (2022). *Internationalization challenges of the SMEs: A case study of three Bangladesh ready-made garment companies*.
<https://www.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2:1668114>
- Ramzan, M. (2023). “Making up stories is an inherently political act”: Mohsin Hamid in conversation. *Journal of Postcolonial Writing*, 59(1), 113-124.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/17449855.2022.2093439>
- Salam-Salmaoui, R., & Ali, R. (2024). Global encounters, local identities: autoethnographic reflections on University of Jyväskylä's internationalization policies and practices. *Cogent Education*, 11(1), 2369972.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/2331186X.2024.2369972>
- Shah, W. A., & Lashari, A. (2023). Regimes of patriarchy and faith: Reflections on challenges in interviewing women and religious minorities in Pakistan. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 23(5), 471-484.

<https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/QRJ-02-2023018/full/html>

- Shah, W. A., Pardesi, H. Y., & Memon, T. (2024). Neoliberalizing subjects through global ELT programs. *TESOL Quarterly*, 58(2), 693-725.
<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/tesq.3242>
- Vandamme, D. (2022). *Role compatibility as socialization: The case of Pakistan*. Routledge.
<https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/mono/10.4324/9781003245940/role-compatibility-socialization-doroth%C3%A9-vandamme>
- Victor, L. (2008). Systematic reviewing in the social sciences: Outcomes and explanation. *Enquire*, 1(1), 32-46.
<https://www.nottingham.ac.uk/sociology/documents/enquire/volume-1-issu1-victor.pdf>
- Waheed, S. F. (2022). *Hidden Histories of Pakistan*. Cambridge University Press.
<https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=QyZTEAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR7&dq=Forced++conversation+in+Pakistan&ots=M5sADinyfm&sig=rAgGzsK8tLKGesAZ0DdGvXQ9oM>
- Walter, A. M. (2021). The self in a time of constant connectivity: Romantic intimacy and the ambiguous promise of mobile phones for young women in Gilgit, northern Pakistan. *American Ethnologist*, 48(4), 446-461.
<https://anthrosource.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/amet.13039>
- Yang, L., Asif, M., & Usman, M. (2022). Strengthening bonds of friendship between Sino-Pakistan. *International Journal of Advanced Humanities Research*, 2(2), 38- 69. https://journals.ekb.eg/article_256389.html
- Zaidi, A. (2022). *Pakistani worldmaking in international politics: Empire, decolonization and Cold war struggles 1950-1989* (Doctoral dissertation). London School of Economics and Political Science. <http://etheses.lse.ac.uk/id/eprint/4486>
- Zhang, H. (2021). *Internationalization of China's developmental state: Mechanisms and impacts* (Doctoral dissertation). George Mason University.
<https://search.proquest.com/openview/4dd2c1a6cd956f41aa40693d7e1976b8/1?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=18750&diss=y>
- Zia, A., Bashir, I., & Hassan, R. (2024). Navigating through a new academic landscape: Challenges and coping strategies of international students studying in Pakistan. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 8(2), 639-649.
<https://www.ojs.pssr.org.pk/journal/article/view/679>