

Legal Context of Minority Rights in Pakistan

The manuscript has not been previously published elsewhere and is not being considered by any other journal. The authors read and approved the final version of the respective manuscript.

Abdul Sammi

Department of Law, Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan
abdulsamijaved6@gmail.com

Dr. Tansif Ur Rehman

Department of Law, Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan
tansif@live.com

Sukaina Ashfaq Syed

Department of Law, Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan
ainnakazmy@gmail.com

Note: The authors have no conflict of interest to declare

Abstract

Minority rights in Pakistan remain a critical issue despite constitutional protections. While the country's legal framework, including Articles 20, 25, and 36 of the Constitution of Pakistan, ensures religious freedom and equality for religious minorities. Christians and Hindus, especially in Sindh, face forced conversions and attacks on their religious sites. Despite judicial interventions and some government initiatives, such as restoring religious sites and forming a National Commission for Minorities, implementation is inconsistent. The international community, including human rights organizations, has

raised concerns, urging Pakistan to improve its protections for minorities. A combination of legal, social, and political factors continues to limit the ability of these groups to enjoy their rights as citizens fully. Overall, significant efforts are still required to ensure true equality, justice, and safety for religious minorities in Pakistan.

Keywords: constitutional protection, freedom, justice, legal framework, minorities rights, Pakistan.

Introduction

Pakistan, a country with a population exceeding 240 million, is home to a wide range of religious and ethnic communities. While Islam is the dominant religion, accounting for over 96% of the population, religious minorities such as Christians, Hindus, Sikhs, and others form a significant portion of the societal fabric. Despite the constitutional guarantees of equality and religious freedom, these minority groups face numerous legal, social, and political challenges that question the country's commitment to human rights (Ahmad et al., 2022).

The Constitution of Pakistan, adopted in 1973, includes provisions to safeguard the rights of minorities. Articles 20, 25, and 36 explicitly provide for protecting religious freedoms, equality before the law, and preserving the legitimate rights and interests of minorities. However, implementing these provisions has been inconsistent, and minority groups often struggle to exercise their rights in practice (Khan, 2021).

Pakistan's history is deeply intertwined with religious identity, as the country was founded in 1947 as a homeland for Muslims of the Indian subcontinent. However, the founding father, Muhammad Ali Jinnah, envisioned a secular state where people of all religions could practice their faith freely. His famous speech on August 11, 1947, emphasized the equality of all citizens regardless of their religion. Despite this vision, Pakistan's trajectory took a different turn, and religion became a central component of national identity, influencing politics, laws, and social norms (Ijaz et al., 2022).

Pakistan's legal system provides formal protections for minority groups. The **blasphemy laws**, particularly Section 295-C of the Pakistan Penal Code, are among the most important and originally intended to protect the religious sentiments of Muslims. However, these laws have been frequently misused, leading to false accusations and violence against religious minorities (Mandal, 2022).

Beyond legal challenges, religious minorities in Pakistan frequently encounter social discrimination and violence. **Hindus and Christians** are often relegated to low-wage, marginalized professions and live in fear of forced conversions, particularly in rural areas like Sindh. Reports of Hindu and Christian girls being abducted, forcibly converted to Islam, and married off to Muslim men are common, with little legal intervention. In some cases, law enforcement authorities are either complicit or slow to act, allowing such injustices to persist (Mirjat, 2023). Despite these challenges, there have been some efforts to address the concerns of minorities. In 2014, the Supreme Court of Pakistan issued a landmark ruling directing the government to establish a National Commission for Minorities and ensure religious site protection. While this ruling was a step in the right direction (Ali et al., 2022).

However, the political will to enact comprehensive reforms remains weak, and meaningful change often comes in response to international pressure rather than domestic advocacy. International human rights organizations, including the U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom (USCIRF), have frequently highlighted the plight of religious minorities in Pakistan and have called for reforms to improve their status (Khan et al., 2024). While Pakistan's constitution protects minority rights, robust governmental action, combined with societal change, is necessary to ensure that Pakistan can fulfill its constitutional promise of equality and justice for all citizens, regardless of their faith (Rasul, 2023).

Research Justification

Research on minority rights in Pakistan is essential due to the country's complex religious, political, social, and cultural landscape and the persistent challenges faced by its minority communities such as Hindus,

Christians, Sikhs, and others. Despite constitutional protections, religious minorities like Christians, Hindus, and others continue to face significant legal, social, and political marginalization. The misuse of blasphemy laws, forced conversions, and systemic exclusion underscore the gap between the law and its implementation, making this a critical area for scholarly inquiry (Ahmad et al., 2022).

Studying this issue sheds light on these marginalized communities' struggles and offers insights into broader human rights practices in Pakistan. This research can contribute to ongoing discussions about governance, justice, and equality in developing nations by examining the intersection of religion, politics, and law. Moreover, understanding the socio-political dynamics perpetuating discrimination against minorities could provide the foundation for policy reforms and advocacy efforts (Jafri et al., 2022).

This research holds international significance in a globalized world where human rights are increasingly interconnected. It can inform global human rights organizations, policymakers, and advocates about Pakistan's challenges, fostering dialogue on how to ensure better protection for religious minorities both within Pakistan and in similar contexts worldwide (Latif et al., 2023).

Research Objectives

1. To discuss the historical context of minority rights in Pakistan.
2. To highlight the theoretical context of minority rights in Pakistan.
3. To analyze the leading laws that govern minority rights in Pakistan.
4. To identify the key challenges regarding minority rights in Pakistan.
5. To explore the opportunities regarding minority rights in Pakistan.
6. To propose effective prevention and intervention strategies.

Research Methodology

This study employed a systematic review methodology, with research objectives established accordingly. A comprehensive literature review was conducted (Komba & Lwoga, 2020). Research findings were categorized based on their content (Hiver et al., 2021; Petticrew & Roberts, 2006), and classified information was incorporated into the study by organizing it into headings (Gan et al., 2021; Pawson et al., 2005). The evaluation of classified information and titles formed the basis of the study (Page, 2021; Rahi, 2017), ensuring the integrity of the research subject and its contents (Egger et al., 2022; Victor, 2008).

Literature Review

The issue of minority rights in Pakistan has been widely discussed in academic and policy-oriented literature, reflecting the complexity of religious, legal, and social dynamics within the country. Scholars, human rights organizations, and international bodies have contributed to understanding the plight of minorities, exploring legal frameworks, societal attitudes, and governmental responses. The literature offers a multifaceted analysis of Pakistan's efforts to protect minority rights and highlights the various challenges.

1. Historical Context and Foundational Ideas

Much of the literature emphasizes the vision of Pakistan's founding leaders, particularly Muhammad Ali Jinnah, who espoused an inclusive and pluralistic approach to minority rights. Jinnah's speech of August 11, 1947, is frequently referenced as the foundational principle for a secular state where citizens, regardless of their faith, would enjoy equal rights. Scholars like Mubeen and Qusien (2017), and Zaheer (2024) argue that the vision of Pakistan as a homeland for Muslims was not intended to marginalize non-Muslims but rather to provide a space where religious freedom would be protected. However, over the decades, the country's political landscape shifted toward religious conservatism, particularly under General Zia-Ul-Haq military regime in the 1980s. His policies set the stage for the challenges that persist today (PIPS, 2023).

2. Legal Framework and Constitutional Provisions

Pakistani constitution guarantees fundamental rights to all citizens, including minorities. Articles 20, 25, and 36 of the Constitution have been extensively analyzed in the literature, particularly regarding their interpretation and implementation. Despite these constitutional guarantees, the legal framework often fails to protect minority communities due to loopholes in the judiciary and law enforcement agencies. The blasphemy laws have been the subject of extensive critique in local and international studies. Analysts such as Khan et al. (2024) argue that the blasphemy laws are frequently used as a tool of persecution, often resulting in mob violence and extrajudicial killings.

Arslan et al. (2022) explores the increasing marginalization of religious communities in Pakistan, including Christians, and Hindus, who have faced long-standing discrimination that has worsened in recent years, now reaching a critical stage. Drawing on thorough research and interviews with activists and representatives of minority groups, the research investigates the primary factors driving ongoing religious discrimination in Pakistan at both institutional and societal levels. It emphasizes that much of this marginalization is fueled by government policies, national laws, and law enforcement practices, which, in turn, empower extremist groups to target these communities without fear of consequence.

To restore safety and equality for all communities in Pakistan, it is crucial to address these systemic and social disparities (PIPS, 2023). Additionally, the persecution of these groups reflects the broader decline in human rights and governance. Ensuring their protection, in collaboration with civil society, religious leaders, law enforcement, and other stakeholders, is urgently necessary. Failure to act threatens the country's diversity and its long-term stability (Zaheer, 2024).

3. Religious Minorities and Socioeconomic Challenges

The literature on minority rights in Pakistan often focuses on specific communities, primarily Christians and Hindus. Studies by Feroze et al. (2022) document how these groups face systemic discrimination in various aspects of life, including education, employment, and political

representation. Hindus, the most significant religious minority, are predominantly concentrated in Sindh province (NCHR, 2022). Literature by Jafri et al. (2022) highlights the issues faced by Hindu women, particularly forced conversions and abductions, which are prevalent in rural Sindh. Such incidents violate human rights and exacerbate social exclusion and marginalization.

Christians, another significant minority group, are often economically disadvantaged and relegated to low-paying, menial jobs (NCHR, 2022). Research by Latif et al. (2023) emphasizes how Christians are frequently subjected to social and economic discrimination. Christian neighborhoods are vulnerable to mob attacks, as seen in incidents such as the Gojra riots in 2009 and Joseph Colony arson in 2013, both of which have been analyzed in the context of religious extremism and state failure to protect vulnerable populations.

4. Recent Developments and Policy Recommendations

Recent studies by Feroze et al. (2022); and Lai et al. (2022) focus on civil society's role in advocating for minority rights. There is a growing presence of NGOs and social activists who use digital platforms or TV channels to raise awareness about minority issues. These platforms provide minorities with a previously suppressed voice in mainstream media.

Scholars like Saeed et al. (2023) and Zaheer (2024) agree that legal reforms alone are insufficient without broader societal changes. His work advocates for educational reforms, interfaith dialogue, and more inclusive media representations to combat entrenched prejudices.

5. International Concerns and Advocacy

The international community has played a significant role in bringing attention to minority rights in Pakistan. Literature by authors such as Brolmann et al. (2023); Hannum (2023); Juergensmeyer (2023); Toki and Raman (2024) highlight the role of international human rights organizations and bodies like the United Nations and the U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom (USCIRF) in advocating for the protection of minorities.

Historical Context of Minority Rights in Pakistan

The history of minority rights in Pakistan traces back to its formation in 1947. Muhammad Ali Jinnah envisioned a country where all citizens, regardless of religion, could practice their faith (Shabbir et al., 2022).

"You are free; you are free to go to your temples; you are free to go to your mosques or any other place of worship in this State of Pakistan. You may belong to any religion, caste, or creed—that has nothing to do with the business of the State."

Muhammad Ali Jinnah (11th August 1947).

However, the 1949 Objectives Resolution set the tone for Pakistan's Islamic identity, raising concerns for minorities. The 1956 Constitution declared Pakistan an Islamic Republic but guaranteed minority rights (Shabbir et al., 2022). The introduction of strict laws, later expanded under General Zia-Ul-Haq's Islamization policies in the 1980s, worsened the situation for minorities, especially Christians and Hindus. Post-Zia, Pakistan saw civilian rule, but systemic discrimination persisted (Arif et al., 2022).

Blasphemy laws have been misused at various instances (PIPS, 2023).

Recent efforts, such as creating the National Commission for Minorities and judicial rulings advocating for minority rights, have shown progress (Ahmad et al., 2022). However, societal biases and legal challenges continue to marginalize minorities, reflecting the ongoing struggle between the State's Islamic character and the constitutional rights of its non-Muslim citizens (Arif et al., 2022).

Theoretical Context of Minority Rights in Pakistan

The theoretical framework surrounding minority rights in Pakistan can be examined through several lenses, including liberalism, human rights theory, and religious nationalism.

1. Liberalism: This theory emphasizes individual freedom and equality, suggesting that all citizens, regardless of religious or ethnic background, should be treated equally under the law. Pakistan's constitutional promises reflect this liberal ideal. However, due to

societal and political influences, the practical enforcement of these ideals has been inconsistent.

2. Human Rights Theory: This theory holds that every individual is entitled to fundamental rights simply by virtue of being human. International human rights conventions, such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, underpin Pakistan's obligations to protect minority rights. Despite signing these international agreements, Pakistan faces challenges aligning national laws with global human rights standards.

3. Religious Nationalism: Pakistan, deeply influenced by the State's Islamic identity, complicates the protection of minority rights. The rise of religious nationalism, especially since the 1980s, has prioritized a singular religious identity, often at the expense of minority communities. This theoretical clash between religious nationalism and liberal democratic values explains much of the systemic discrimination faced by minorities in Pakistan. Religious minorities face persecution, while minority women encounter intersectional discrimination based on both gender and religion.

Leading Minority Rights Laws in Pakistan

In Pakistan, federal and provincial governments have enacted laws to protect minority rights. These legal provisions are rooted in the constitution, but additional federal and provincial laws further regulate religious freedom, anti-discrimination, and the protection of minority communities.

1. Federal Laws

- i. **Constitution of Pakistan (1973):** Article 20 of the Constitution of Pakistan guarantees freedom of religion, allowing citizens to profess, practice, and propagate their faith. Article 25 of the Constitution of Pakistan ensures equality before the law, prohibiting discrimination based on religion. Article 36 of the Constitution of Pakistan obligates the State to protect the rights and interests of religious minorities.

- ii. **Blasphemy Laws (Sections 295-298 of the Pakistan Penal Code):** These laws are important for the protection of the religious sentiments of Muslims, but some extremists often misuse these laws for their personal issues against religious minorities. The laws criminalize defaming religious figures and sacred texts, with penalties ranging from imprisonment to death.
- iii. **National Commission for Minorities Act (2014):** This act established a commission to safeguard minority rights, promote interfaith harmony, and address issues faced by minority communities.

2. Provincial Laws

- i. **Sindh Criminal Law (Protection of Minorities) Act (2016):** In November 2016, the Sindh Assembly unanimously passed a bill against forced religious conversions presented to the Assembly in 2015. This is a milestone for human rights and minority rights in the region. This law, aimed at curbing forced conversions, particularly in the Sindh province, protects religious minorities from forced religious conversions, especially targeting vulnerable Hindu and Christian women.
- ii. **Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Protection of Communal Properties of Minorities Act (2014):** This law protects the communal properties of minority groups from illegal occupation or damage.
- iii. **Punjab Minorities Rights Commission Act (2019):** This law established a provincial commission to protect and promote minority rights, investigate violations, and recommend policies for the social and economic uplift of minorities.

While these laws are crucial, their implementation remains a challenge, with ongoing issues of discrimination and misuse, particularly concerning forced conversions (Ali et al., 2022; Khan, 2021; Latif et al., 2023; Mandal, 2022).

Challenges for Minority Rights in Pakistan

1. Social Intolerance: Religious minorities face widespread societal discrimination. Intolerance, often fueled by extremist ideologies, manifests in mob violence, forced conversions, and social exclusion. Minorities are often marginalized in education, employment, and access to justice, making it difficult for them to assert their rights.

2. Political Marginalization: Minorities have limited political representation, which weakens their ability to advocate for their rights. Pakistan's electoral system provides reserved seats for minorities, but they remain underrepresented and politically powerless, as mainstream parties rarely prioritize their issues.

3. Religious Extremism: The rise of religious extremism in Pakistan has further endangered minorities, with sectarian groups frequently targeting them. Attacks on places of worship, forced conversions of Hindu and Christian girls, and hate speech against religious minorities continue to undermine their safety.

3. Weak Enforcement of Laws: Although Pakistan has laws to protect minorities, including the 'National Commission for Minorities', enforcement is weak. Legal protections are often overshadowed by societal pressures, making it difficult for minorities to seek justice.

Opportunities for Minority Rights in Pakistan

1. Judicial Interventions: Pakistan's judiciary has, at times, defended minority rights. Landmark rulings, such as the 2014 Supreme Court judgment, have directed the government to take proactive measures to protect minorities. Continued judicial activism can help curb discrimination and ensure justice for marginalized communities.

2. Civil Society Advocacy: Human rights organizations and civil society groups in Pakistan are active in advocating for minority rights. Through public awareness campaigns, legal support, and community organizing, these groups are instrumental in highlighting injustices and pushing for reform.

3. International Pressure: As a signatory to international conventions like the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Pakistan faces pressure from the global community to improve its human rights record. This pressure can encourage legal reforms and better protections for minorities.

4. Youth and Media Engagement: Pakistan's growing youth population and the rise of social media platforms provide a space for more progressive discussions on human rights. Youth-led movements and media outlets increasingly advocate for tolerance, religious freedom, and minority rights, offering hope for cultural change.

Discussion

Minority rights in Pakistan have been a subject of both domestic and international discourse for several decades. Pakistan is a country founded on the principles of equality, with Muhammad Ali Jinnah's vision of a pluralistic society where all citizens have equal rights. Despite constitutional guarantees, many minorities face discrimination, marginalization, and even violence. Despite these challenges, the Pakistani government has addressed minority concerns. In 2016, a National Commission for Minorities was established, and special police forces were created to protect minorities' places of worship.

Educational reforms have also been initiated to eliminate biased content from school textbooks, which often portray minorities in a negative light. Civil society organizations continue to advocate for minority rights, and some political parties have taken up minority issues in their manifestos. Moving forward, the protection of minority rights in Pakistan will require a multifaceted approach. Legal reforms are necessary to prevent misuse and ensure justice for minorities. Moreover, Strengthening the rule of law, promoting interfaith dialogue, and improving minority representation in decision-making bodies can help bridge the gap between policy and practice.

The issue of minority rights in Pakistan reflects a broader struggle between the country's foundational ideals of equality and the realities of social and legal discrimination. A genuine commitment to pluralism, coupled with legal and societal reforms, is essential to ensuring that all

citizens of Pakistan, regardless of their religion or ethnicity, can enjoy the rights promised to them under the constitution. This path will strengthen Pakistan's social fabric and enhance its standing on the global stage as a nation committed to justice and human rights.

Conclusion

The history of minority rights in Pakistan is marked by tension between the nation's founding vision of equality and its evolving Islamic identity. Despite constitutional guarantees, minorities continue to face systemic discrimination, social exclusion, and, at times, violent persecution. While legal frameworks exist to protect minority rights, such as the provisions in the 1973 Constitution and various provincial laws, enforcement remains a significant challenge, often overshadowed by societal intolerance and religious extremism.

Nevertheless, there are opportunities for progress. Judicial activism, civil society advocacy, and international pressure offer hope for reforms that could strengthen protections for minorities. Educational reforms and creating institutions like the National Commission for Minorities are steps in the right direction. Additionally, Pakistan's vibrant youth and increasing engagement with social media provide platforms for fostering tolerance and promoting interfaith harmony.

International human rights organizations and advocacy groups continue highlighting these issues and urging comprehensive changes. To achieve lasting change, Pakistan must work towards balancing its Islamic identity with the inclusive, pluralistic ideals envisioned by Muhammad Ali Jinnah. It requires comprehensive legal reforms, effective enforcement of minority protections, and a societal shift towards greater acceptance and respect for diversity. Effective protection of minority rights in Pakistan will require not only legal reforms but also a significant shift in societal attitudes towards tolerance and inclusivity. Only through sustained efforts can Pakistan move towards a future where all citizens, regardless of their religion or ethnicity, are treated with equality, dignity, and justice.

Recommendations

1. Reform Blasphemy Laws

Amend Section 295-C of the Pakistan Penal Code to prevent misuse and ensure that blasphemy accusations are handled with due process. Introduce safeguards against false accusations and ensure that investigations and prosecutions are conducted impartially. Current blasphemy laws have been used to target religious minorities unfairly, leading to violence and persecution. Reforms would protect individuals from misuse and ensure a fair legal process.

2. Strengthen Legal Protections for Minorities

Enhance the enforcement of existing constitutional protections for minorities by establishing independent oversight mechanisms to monitor and report violations. Create specialized units within law enforcement agencies to address hate crimes and discrimination against minorities. Strengthening legal protections and ensuring effective enforcement are crucial for safeguarding minority rights and addressing discriminatory practices.

3. Increase Representation and Inclusion

Promote greater political representation for minorities by implementing reserved seats in legislative bodies and ensuring their inclusion in decision-making processes. Support minority participation in local and national governance. Increased representation can help address the specific needs of minority communities and ensure their voices are heard in policymaking.

4. Combat Forced Conversions and Abductions

Enact and enforce strict laws against forced conversions and abductions, particularly targeting young women from minority communities. Establish dedicated support services for victims and their families. Forced conversions and abductions are serious human rights violations that disproportionately affect minority women and girls. Effective legal measures and support systems are necessary to combat these abuses.

5. Enhance Educational and Economic Opportunities

Implement affirmative action policies to improve educational and economic opportunities for minority communities. Provide scholarships, vocational training, and employment support tailored to the needs of minorities. Educational and economic disparities contribute to the marginalization of minorities. Enhancing opportunities can help reduce socioeconomic inequalities and promote social inclusion.

6. Protect Religious Sites and Places of Worship

Strengthen security measures for religious sites and places of worship belonging to minority communities. Develop emergency response plans and provide funding for the maintenance and protection of these sites. Attacks on religious sites undermine the safety and security of minority communities. Protecting these sites is essential for preserving religious freedom and preventing violence.

7. Promote Interfaith Dialogue and Education

Encourage interfaith dialogue and educational programs promoting understanding and tolerance among religious communities. Support initiatives that foster positive interactions and mutual respect. Interfaith dialogue and education can help combat prejudice and build a more inclusive society by fostering mutual understanding and respect among religious groups.

8. Strengthen Judicial Accountability and Independence

Ensure judicial accountability and independence by implementing reforms that enhance the transparency and fairness of the judicial process. Provide training for judges and law enforcement officials on minority rights and non-discrimination. An independent and accountable judiciary is crucial for upholding minority rights and ensuring that justice is served impartially.

9. Enhance International Cooperation and Support

Collaborate with international human rights organizations and donor agencies to implement projects and initiatives to improve minority rights. Seek technical assistance and funding for programs that address

minority issues. International cooperation can provide valuable resources and expertise to support efforts to protect and promote minority rights in Pakistan

10. Increase Public Awareness and Advocacy

Launch public awareness campaigns and advocacy programs to highlight the importance of minority rights and challenge discriminatory attitudes. Engage civil society organizations and media in promoting human rights and social justice. Raising public awareness and fostering advocacy can help shift societal attitudes, build support for minority rights, and drive meaningful change at the community and national levels.

These recommendations aim to address the systemic issues affecting minority communities in Pakistan and promote a more inclusive and equitable society.

Research Limitations

1. Data Availability: Reliable and comprehensive data on minorities' experiences and conditions can be scarce due to government restrictions, lack of accurate record-keeping, and societal reluctance to report discrimination.

2. Research Bias: Much of the existing research may be influenced by the biases of authors, particularly those from or affiliated with religious or political groups, potentially skewing the findings.

3. Political Sensitivity: The politically sensitive nature of minority issues in Pakistan can limit the scope of research and access to information, as researchers may face restrictions or threats.

4. Cultural Barriers: Differences in language and cultural understanding can hinder gathering and interpreting data from minority communities.

5. Lack of Longitudinal Studies: Limited longitudinal research makes it challenging to assess the long-term impact of policies and societal changes on minority rights.

Research Implications

The research on minority rights in Pakistan underscores several critical implications for policy and practice. First, there is a pressing need for comprehensive legal reforms to address the misuse of blasphemy laws and to strengthen protections for minorities. Policymakers should consider amending or repealing discriminatory laws and ensuring that legal protections are effectively enforced. Second, increased support and resources for law enforcement and judicial bodies are essential to ensure the protection of minorities and to hold perpetrators of violence accountable.

Third, fostering interfaith dialogue and promoting educational programs to reduce religious intolerance can help shift societal attitudes toward greater inclusivity. Finally, international pressure and advocacy can be pivotal in encouraging domestic reforms and protecting minority rights. Addressing these areas will be crucial in creating a more equitable and just society for all citizens in Pakistan.

Future Research Directions

- 1. Impact of Legal Reforms:** Investigate the effectiveness of recent and proposed legal reforms aimed at protecting minority rights. It includes evaluating the implementation of laws and their impact on reducing discrimination and violence.
- 2. Societal Attitudes and Change:** Study the evolving societal attitudes towards minorities. Research should explore how educational and social initiatives can address prejudice and promote inclusivity.
- 3. Role of Civil Society:** Research could examine the role of civil society organizations in advocating for minority rights and assess their effectiveness in influencing policy and raising awareness.
- 5. Comparative Studies:** Conduct comparative studies with other countries facing similar challenges to identify best practices and effective strategies for improving minority rights.
- 6. Economic and Social Integration:** Explore the socioeconomic barriers minorities face, including access to education, employment, and

healthcare, and develop strategies for improving their economic integration.

7. International Influence: Analyze how international pressure and human rights advocacy impact domestic policies on minority rights in Pakistan and assess the effectiveness of these external interventions.

References

- Ahmad, T., Mustafa, G., & Asfa, R. (2022). Political rights of Christian minority in Pakistan before 1973. *South Asian studies*, 37(1).
<http://111.68.103.26//journals/index.php/IJSAS/article/view/6022>
- Ali, A., Arslan, M., & Mustafa, G. (2022). Minorities rights protection in Punjab (Pakistan): A comparative analysis of Christians, Hindus and Sikhs. *Annals of human and social sciences*, 3(2), 418-428.
<https://ojs.ahss.org.pk/journal/article/view/101>
- Arif, M., Ali, I., & Asfaham, M. (2022). Domestic policies of general Zia Ul Haq towards Islamization during 1979-88. *Harf-O-Sukhan*, 6(1), 60-69.
<https://www.harf-o-sukhan.com/index.php/Harf-o-sukhan/article/view/274>
- Arslan, M., Shah, B. H., & Mustafa, G. (2022). Minorities rights in Punjab: Primary data-based analysis of Hindu minority. *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs*, 5(3).
<https://www.pjia.com.pk/index.php/pjia/article/view/579>
- Brodmann, C., Lefebvre, R., & Zieck, M. (Eds.). (2023). *Peoples and minorities in international law*. Brill.
https://books.google.com.pk/books?hl=en&lr=&id=rsP7EAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR3&dq=+protection+of+minority+rights&ots=mhZWZ3W7xd&sig=WON177GBCbVyz1yh5iSKtK9UDAA&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=protection%20of%20minority%20rights&f=false
- Egger, M., Higgins, J. P., & Smith, G. D. (Eds.). (2022). *Systematic reviews in health research: Meta-analysis in context*. John Wiley & Sons
- Feroze, S., Lak, T. A., & Malik, M. A. (2022). Impact of affirmative actions to enhance participation of minorities in governance of Pakistan. *Contemporary Issues in Social Sciences and Management Practices*, 1(2), 73-88.
<https://www.cissmp.com/index.php/CISSMP/article/view/20>
- Gan, J., Xie, L., Peng, G., Xie, J., Chen, Y., & Yu, Q. (2021). Systematic review on modification methods of dietary fiber. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 119, 106872.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2021.106872>
- Hannum, H. (Ed.). (2023). *Documents on autonomy and minority rights*.
- Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.
https://books.google.com.pk/books?hl=en&lr=&id=Nsj7EAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR3&dq=+protection+of+minority+rights&ots=YGQ2rx-M4f&sig=eQU5dlzrU9F2GdfVDtjhndNojo&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=protection%20of%20minority%20rights&f=false
- Hiver, P., Al-Hoorie, A. H., Vitta, J. P., & Wu, J. (2021). Engagement in language learning: A systematic review of 20 years of research methods and definitions. *Language Teaching Research*, 13621688211001289.

- <https://doi.org/10.1177/13621688211001289>
- Ijaz, S., Sultana, S., & Ziauddin, M. (2022). Jinnah's Pakistan and constitutional status of minorities. *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs*, 5(2).
<https://www.pjia.com.pk/index.php/pjia/article/view/573>
- Jafri, M. H., Ijaz, S., & Ziauddin, M. (2022). The rising marginalization of religious minorities: a case of Pakistan. *Pakistan journal of international affairs*, 5(3).
<https://pjia.com.pk/index.php/pjia/article/view/570>
- Juergensmeyer, M. (2023). *The new cold war: Religious nationalism confronts the secular state* (Vol. 5). University of California Press.
https://books.google.com.pk/books?hl=en&lr=&id=qBJmeM6DiBAC&oi=fnd&pg=PR9&dq=religious+nationalism&ots=IMLj1zmsNg&sig=1_eCDqIQQjVtjBgkG6uLtQegDZ0&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=religious%20nationalism&f=false
- Khan, M. I., & Riaz, N. (2024). Blasphemy laws in Pakistan: A legal analysis and contemporary discourse. *International Journal of Social Science Archives*, 7(1).
<https://openurl.ebsco.com/EPDB%3Aagcd%3A5%3A17675461/detailv2?sid=ebsco%3Aplink%3Ascholar&id=ebsco%3Aagcd%3A176421202&crl=c>
- Khan, S. A. (2021). *The struggle for reform and human rights in Pakistan's fractured polity*.
<https://www.degruyter.com/document/doi/10.1515/9781685857288-006/pdf?licenseType=restricted>
- Komba, M. M., & Lwoga, E. T. (2020). *Systematic review as a research method in library and information science*.
<https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-7998-1471-9.ch005>
- Lai, C., Gu, M., Gao, F., & Yung, J. W. S. (2022). Motivational mechanisms of ethnic minorities' social media engagement with mainstream culture. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 43(5), 387-403.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/01434632.2020.1738442>
- Latif, D. A., Zaka, S., & Ali, D. S. (2023). Religious freedom and minorities' discrimination: A case study of Christians' socio-economic discrimination in Pakistan. *Bulletin of Business and Economics*, 12(1), 73-80.
<https://bbejournal.com/BBE/article/view/491>
- Mandal, R. (2022). Rights of minorities in India and Pakistan: A comparative study. *Indian JL & just.*, 13, 190.
<https://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?handle=hein.journals/ijlj13&div=15&id=&page=>
- Mirjat, R. B. (2023). Minority rights with reference to judicial precedents in Pakistan. *European journal of economics, law and politics*, 10(2), 1-10.

<https://www.ceeol.com/search/article-detail?id=1197746>

- Mubeen, A., & Qusien, R. (2017). Minorities in Pakistan: Role of Pakistani private TV channels in highlighting minorities' rights. *Online Journal of Communication and Media Technologies*, 7(2), 96-113.
<https://arastirmax.com/en/publication/online-journal-communication-and-media-technologies/7/2/96-113-minorities-pakistan-role-pakistani-private-tv-channels-highlighting-minorities-rights/arid/438149eb-00a6>
- NCHR. (2022). *Pakistan's minority employment quotas: Myths and realities*.
https://nchr.gov.pk/press_release/test/
- Page, M. J., McKenzie, J. E., Bossuyt, P. M., Boutron, I., Hoffmann, T. C., Mulrow, C. D., Shamseer, L., Tetzlaff, J. M., & Moher, D. (2021). Updating guidance for reporting systematic reviews: Development of the PRISMA 2020 statement. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, 134, 103-112.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclinepi.2021.02.003>
- Pawson, R., Greenhalgh, T., Harvey, G., & Walshe, K (2005). Realist review - A new method of systematic review designed for complex policy interventions. *Journal of Health Services Research Policy*, 10(1), 21-34.
<https://doi.org/10.1258/1355819054308530>
- Petticrew, M., & Roberts, H. (2006). *Systematic reviews in the social sciences: A practical guide*. Blackwell Publishing.
<https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470754887>
- PIPS. (2023). *Minority rights in Pakistan: Historic neglect or state complicity*.
<https://www.pakpips.com/article/book/minority-rights-in-pakistan-historic-neglect-or-state-complicity>
- Rahi, S. (2017). Research design and methods: A systematic review of research paradigms, sampling issues, and instruments development. *International Journal of Economics Management Sciences*, 6(2).
<https://doi.org/10.4172/2162-6359.1000403>
- Rasul, R. (2023). *Identity politics and minorities in Pakistan*.
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/232818662_Identity_Politics_and_Minorities_in_Pakistan
- Saeed, R. A., Saghir, I., & Ahmad, W. (2023). Academic research on non-Muslim religious minorities: Content analysis of the research papers from a Pakistani perspective. *Journal of World Religions and Interfaith Harmony*, 2(1), 120-149.
<https://journals.iub.edu.pk/index.php/jwrih/article/view/1733>
- Shabbir, G., Jawad, K., & Hanif, K. (2022). *The charismatic leadership of Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah: His vision and constitutionalism*. *Pakistan languages and humanities review*, 6(1), 159-167.
<https://ojs.plhr.org.pk/journal/article/view/507>

-
- Toki, V., & Raman, D. (2024). Indigenous and minority activism under the United Nations. *International Journal on Minority and Group Rights, 1*, 1-19.
<https://brill.com/view/journals/ijgr/aop/article-10.1163-15718115-bja10172/article-10.1163-15718115-bja10172.xml>
 - Victor, L. (2008). Systematic reviewing in the social sciences: Outcomes and explanation. *Enquire, 1*(1), 32-46.
<https://www.nottingham.ac.uk/sociology/documents/enquire/volume-1-issue-1-victor.pdf>
 - Zaheer, A. (2024). *Religious minorities of Pakistan: The art of resistance*.
<https://blogs.lse.ac.uk/southasia/2024/08/26/religious-minorities-of-pakistan-the-art-of-resistance/>